# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF FLORIDA

#### WEST PALM BEACH DIVISION

OAK FOREST PRODUCTS, INC., a Florida Corporation,

Defendants.

Plaintiff, vs.	Case No.:
HISCOCK & BARCLAY, LLP, a New York Limited Liability Partnership and THOMAS R. FITZGERALD, individually,	

## **DEFENDANT HISCOCK & BARCLAY, LLP'S NOTICE OF REMOVAL**

Defendant HISCOCK & BARCLAY, LLP, ("H&B"), a New York Limited Liability Parntership, hereby gives notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1332(a)(1), 1338(a) and 28 U.S.C. §§ 1441 and 1446, that the case entitled *Oak Forest Products, Inc. v. Hiscock & Barclay, et al*, Case No. 12-46-CA – Metzger, is being removed from the Circuit Court of the Nineteenth Judicial Circuit, in and for Martin County, Florida to the United States District Court for the Southern District of Florida. In support of this Notice, H&B states:

- 1. On or about January 10, 2012, Plaintiff, OAK FOREST PRODUCTS, INC. ("OAK FOREST"), commenced this action against Defendants in the Circuit Court of the Nineteenth Judicial Circuit in and for Martin County, Florida under the caption of *Oak Forest Products, Inc. v. Hiscock & Barclay, LLP et al,* Case No. 12-46-CA –Metzger. A copy of the Summons and Complaint filed in state court, attached collectively as Exhibit "A," constitute all process, pleadings, discovery and orders served by Plaintiff upon H&B in this action to date.
  - 2. Plaintiff Oak Forest, is a Florida Corporation. See Complaint, Exhibit A, ¶3.

Case 1:12-cv-00751-DGL Document 1 Filed 03/21/12 Page 2 of 7

Case No.:

- 3. Defendant H&B is a New York Limited Liability Partnership. H&B does not have any offices in the State of Florida. *See*, Complaint, Exhibit A, ¶4
- 4. Defendant Thomas R. Fitzgerald is a citizen and resident of the State of New York. See Complaint, Exhibit A, ¶6.
- 5. The causes of action in Plaintiff's Complaint are based on claims of legal malpractice allegedly occurring in connection with the underlying issues raised in an action which was recently dismissed in the United States District Court for the Western District of New York and captioned *Oak Forest Products, Inc. v. Home Depot USA, Inc. and King of Fans, Inc.*, Case No. 08-CV-6531.
- 6. This Court has original subject matter jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1332(a)(1) and 1338(a) as the lawsuit involves citizens of different states and the amount in controversy exceeds \$75,000.00, exclusive of interest and costs, and it sets forth a claim for relief requiring resolution of substantive issues of patent and copyright law. That amount at issue is based upon Oak Forest's allegations in the Complaint that it seeks damages for copyright infringement, patent infringement, lost profits, royalties, attorney's fees and costs, and prejudgment interest. Oak Forest seeks such damages for actions which commenced either in 2003 or 2008. See Complaint, Exhibit A, ¶¶27, 34, 50 and 62. Under the Federal Court Jurisdiction and Venue Clarification Act of 2011, §103, where Plaintiff has not specified an amount of damages, a defendant may state the amount in controversy in its Notice of Removal;
- 8. For purposes of Removal, venue is proper in the United States District Court, Southern District of Florida, Miami Division, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a) because the case is removed from the Circuit Court in and for Martin County, Florida.

Case 1:12-cv-00751-DGL Document 1 Filed 03/21/12 Page 3 of 7

Case No.:

9. The Complaint consists of two counts of legal malpractice involving patent

litigation.

10. Defendant Thomas R. Fitzgerald consents to this removal. See, Affidavit of Mr.

Fitzgerald, attached hereto as Exhibit B.

11. This action is being removed within thirty (30) days of service of the Complaint

upon H&B. See, Summons, attached hereto as part of Exhibit A.

12. A copy of this Notice has been filed contemporaneously with the Clerk of the

Circuit Court in and for Martin County, Florida, and has been served on Plaintiff.

WHEREFORE, Defendant, HISCOCK & BARCLAY, LLP respectfully gives Notice of

Removal of the action, Oak Forest Products, Inc. v. Hiscock & Barclay, et al, Case No. 12-46-

CA – Metzger, now pending in the Circuit Court in and for Martin County, Florida, and requests

that this case proceed in this Court as an action properly removed to it, and that this Court make

such further orders as are just and equitable.

Dated: March 21, 2012

David P. Hartnett

**David Hartnett** 

Florida Bar No. 946631

dhartnett@hinshawlaw.com

HINSHAW & CULBERTSON LLP

9155 S. Dadeland Boulevard- Suite 1600

Miami, Florida 33156-2741

Telephone: 305-358-7747

Facsimile: 305-577-1063

3

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on March 21, 2012, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system which will send a notice of electronic filing to counsel listed below. A courtesy copy has also been sent via mail and electronic mail as well to counsel listed below.

By: David P. Hartnett

David P. Hartnett

Edward R. Curtis, Esquire, Tripp, Scott, P.A. 110 SE 6th Street, 15th Floor Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33156 Attorneys for Plaintiff Email: erc@TrippScott.com

Tel: 954-525-7500 Fax: 954-761-8475 Thomas E. Scott, Esquire
Cole, Scott & Kissane, P.A.
9150 S. Dadeland Blvd.
Suite 1400
Miami, Florida 33156
Attorneys for Defendant Fitzgerald
Email: Thomas.Scott@csklegal.com

Tel.: 305-350-5300 Fax.: 305-373-2294

S JS 44 (Rev. 12/07)

# Case 1:12-cv-007**5CIDGL COVIER SHEFTE**d 03/21/12 Page 5 of 7

		0	
The JS 44 civil cover she	eet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of ple	eadings or other papers as required by law	, except as provided
by local rules of court.	This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required	d for the use of the Clerk of Court for the	purpose of initiating
	SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON THE DEVERSE OF THE FORM		

die eivit docket sileet. (SEE E451	ROCTIONS ON THE REV	ERSE OF THE PO	KIVI.)							
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS OAK FOREST PRODUCTS, INC.				<b>DEFENDANTS</b> HISCOCK & BARCLAY, LLP and THOMAS R. FITZGERALD						ALD
(b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff - Martin (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)				NOTE: IN I	County of Residence of First Listed Defendant: New York (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE					
(c) Attorney's (Firm Name, Address, and Telephone Number) Edward R. Curtis, Esquire Tripp Scott, P.A. 110 SE 6 <sup>th</sup> Street – 15 <sup>th</sup> Floor Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33301 Phone: 954 525-7500				Attorneys (If Known)  David P. Hartnett, Esquire  Hinshaw & Culbertson, LLP  9155 So. Dadeland Blvd, #1600,  Miami, FL 33156  Phone: 305 358-7747						
				(For Diversity Case	es Only)		AL PARTIES (P		for Defenda	ant)
1 U.S. Government Plaintiff				tizen of This State	<b>PTF</b>	DEF 1	Incorporated or Princip of Business In Thi		PTF 4	DEF 4
U.S. Government Defendant	☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)			Citizen of Another State 2				-	<b>□</b> 5	□ 5
W. N. WYDE OF SYM			Ci	tizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	☐ 3	□ 3	Foreign Nation	,	□ 6	☐ 6
IV. NATURE OF SUIT	·	· /		·				т		
CONTRACT	A 22-0	RTS		FORFEITURE/PE	NALTY	_	BANKRUPTCY		IER STAT	
110 Insurance 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 151 Medicare Act 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excl. Veterans) 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits	PERSONAL INJURY  310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product Liability 320 Assault, Libel & Slander 330 Federal Employers' Liability 340 Marine 345 Marine Product Liability 350 Motor Vehicle	PERSONAL IN.  362 Personal Injumed. Malpr 365 Personal Injumed. Malpr Product Lial  368 Asbestos Pe Injury Product Liability PERSONAL PRO 370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Ler 380 Other Person	actice ury — bility rsonal act PERTY	610 Agriculture 620 Other Food & 625 Drug Related s of Property 21 630 Liquor Laws 640 R.R. & Truck 650 Airline Regs. 660 Occupational Safety/Health 690 Other LABOR	Seizure I USC 881	PRO 820 830 840	Appeal 28 USC 158 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PERTY RIGHTS Copyrights Patent Trademark CIAL SECURITY	410 Anti 430 Bank 450 Com 460 Dept 470 Rack Corr 480 Cons 490 Cabl 810 Sele- 850Secur	400 State Reapportionment 410 Antitrust 430 Banks and Banking 450 Commerce 460 Deportation 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations 480 Consumer Credit 490 Cable/Sat TV 810 Selective Service 850Securities/Commodities/ Exchange	
160 Stockholders' Suits 190 Other Contract 195 Contract Product Liability 196 Franchise REAL PROPERTY	355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability 360 Other Personal Injury  CIVIL RIGHTS  Product Liabi Product Liabi Product Liabi		mage bility ITIONS	nage		862 863 864	661 HIA (1395ff) 662 Black Lung (923) 663 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) 664 SSID Title XVI 665 RSI (405(g))	875 Customer Challenge 12 USC 3410 890 Other Statutory Actions 891 Agricultural Acts 892 Economic Stabilization Act 893 Environmental Matters		
210 Land Condemnation	441 Voting	510 Motions to	Vacate	790 Other Labor L			A	894 Ener	gy Allocatio	n Act
220 Foreclosure 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment	442 Employment 443 Housing/	Sentence Habeas Corpus	:	791 Empl. Ret. Inc		FEDERAL TAX SUITS			edom of	Information
240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property	Accommodations  444 Welfare  445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment  446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other  440 Other Civil Rights	Accommodations 44 Welfare 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - Employment 446 Amer. w/Disabilities - Other  530 General 535 Death Pena 540 Mandamus 550 Civil Right		IMMIGRATI  462 Naturalization A 463 Habeas Corpu Alien Detaine 465 Other Immigra Actions	pplication s – e	871	Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609	Act  900Appeal of Fee Determinatic  Under Equal Acc to Justice  950 Constitutionality of State Statutes		l Access
☐ 1 Original ☐ 2 Remo	Court Appell	ate Court	Reinsta Reope	nted or 5 anoth	ify)	t [	6 Multidistrict Litigation	☐ 7 Ju M Ju	peal to Dis dge from agistrate dgment	trict
VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	00 XX00 00 1000	(a)(1), 1338(a)	) and 2	filing ( <b>Do not cite j</b> u 8 U.S.C. 1441 an			tutes unless diversit	y):		
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT:	UNDER F.R.C.P. 2	IS A CLASS ACT	ION	DEMAND \$			CHECK YES JURY DEMA		nanded in o ⊠Yes [	
VIII. RELATED CASE	(See instructions):	UDGE		7,/7	>	DOCK	ET NUMBER		3 - 2	v 11 0-3
DATE 2/21/12		SIGNATURE	F ATTOF	ENEY OF RECORD						
3/21/12			then	XV-1/2/V	'/					
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY		~								
RECEIPT #A	MOUNT	APPLYING IFP		JUDGE			MAG. JUDGE			

JS 44 Reverse (Rev. 12/07)

#### INSTRUCTIONS FOR ATTORNEYS COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET FORM JS 44

### Authority For Civil Cover Sheet

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and service of pleading or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. The attorney filing a case should complete the form as follows:

- I. (a) Plaintiffs-Defendants. Enter names (last, first, middle initial) of plaintiff and defendant. If the plaintiff or defendant is a government agency, use only the full name or standard abbreviations. If the plaintiff or defendant is an official within a government agency, identify first the agency and then the official, giving both name and title.
- (b) County of Residence. For each civil case filed, except U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county where the first listed plaintiff resides at the time of filing. In U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county in which the first listed defendant resides at the time of filing. (NOTE: In land condemnation cases, the county of residence of the "defendant" is the location of the tract of land involved.)
- (c) Attorneys. Enter the firm name, address, telephone number, and attorney of record. If there are several attorneys, list them on an attachment, noting in this section "(see attachment)".
- II. Jurisdiction. The basis of jurisdiction is set forth under Rule 8(a), F.R.C.P., which requires that jurisdictions be shown in pleadings. Place an "X" in one of the boxes. If there is more than one basis of jurisdiction, precedence is given in the order shown below

United States plaintiff. (1) Jurisdiction based on 28 U.S.C. 1345 and 1348. Suits by agencies and officers of the United States are included here.

United States defendant. (2) When the plaintiff is suing the United States, its officers or agencies, place an "X" in this box.

Federal question. (3) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1331, where jurisdiction arises under the Constitution of the United States, an amendment to the Constitution, an act of Congress or a treaty of the United States. In cases where the U.S. is a party, the U.S. plaintiff or defendant code takes precedence, and box 1 or 2 should be marked.

Diversity of citizenship. (4) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1332, where parties are citizens of different states. When Box 4 is checked, the citizenship of the different parties must be checked. (See Section III below; federal question actions take precedence over diversity cases.)

- **III.** Residence (citizenship) of Principal Parties. This section of the JS 44 is to be completed if diversity of citizenship was indicated above. Mark this section for each principal party.
- IV. Nature of Suit. Place an "X" in the appropriate box. If the nature of suit cannot be determined, be sure the cause of action, in Section VI below, is sufficient to enable the deputy clerk or the statistical clerks in the Administrative Office to determine the nature of suit. If the cause fits more than one nature of suit, select the most definitive.
- V. Origin. Place an "X" in one of the seven boxes.

Original Proceedings. (1) Cases which originate in the United States district courts.

Removed from State Court. (2) Proceedings initiated in state courts may be removed to the district courts under Title 28 U.S.C., Section 1441. When the petition for removal is granted, check this box.

Remanded from Appellate Court. (3) Check this box for cases remanded to the district court for further action. Use the date of remand as the filing date.

Reinstated or Reopened. (4) Check this box for cases reinstated or reopened in the district court. Use the reopening date as the filing date.

Transferred from Another District. (5) For cases transferred under Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1404(a). Do not use this for within district transfers or multidistrict litigation transfers.

Multidistrict Litigation. (6) Check this box when a multidistrict case is transferred into the district under authority of Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1407. When this box is checked, do not check (5) above.

Appeal to District Judge from Magistrate Judgment. (7) Check this box for an appeal from a magistrate judge's decision.

VI. Cause of Action. Report the civil statute directly related to the cause of action and give a brief description of the cause. **Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity.** Example: U.S. Civil Statute: 47 USC 553

Brief Description: Unauthorized reception of cable service

VII. Requested in Complaint. Class Action. Place an "X" in this box if you are filing a class action under Rule 23, F.R.Cv.P.

## Case 1:12-cv-00751-DGL Document 1 Filed 03/21/12 Page 7 of 7

Demand. In this space enter the dollar amount (in thousands of dollars) being demanded or indicate other demand such as a preliminary injunction.

Jury Demand. Check the appropriate box to indicate whether or not a jury is being demanded.

VIII. Related Cases. This section of the JS 44 is used to reference related pending cases if any. If there are related pending cases, insert the docket numbers and the corresponding judge names for such cases.

Date and Attorney Signature. Date and sign the civil cover sheet.